MIKOŁAJ PAWLAK Graduate School for Social Research

The Children of Foreigners in Polish Lower Secondary Schools— Two Strategies of Coping with Them

Abstract: The research report is based upon study carried out in Poland within the project "Xenophob. The European Dilemma: Institutional Patterns and Politics of 'Racial' Discrimination." Part of the project entailed conducting interviews and making visits in Polish schools attended by immigrant children. The paper presents selected results of a study regarding the situation of refugee pupils in Polish educational system. The research report is based on the analysis of semi-structured interviews with teachers, other school staff, members of NGO's based, or connected with, two lower secondary schools. In the research report I compare two very different situations of refugee pupils: the first school had to admit pupils from the hostel that is located in the school's cachment, the second school actively attracts refugee pupils to promote its tolerance teaching programs. The strategies developed by schools are called: strategy of admittance and strategy of encouragement.

Keywords: immigration, education, Polish educational system, admittance, encouragement, children, protoinstitutionality

General Information

This research report presents a study of the presence of immigrant children in Polish schools conducted within the framework of the international research project *Xenophobe. The European Dilemma: Institutional Patterns and Politics of 'Racial' Discrimination.*¹ This project is being realised in eight European countries (Sweden, Austria, France, United Kingdom, Germany, Italy, Cyprus and Poland) and is concerned with the institutional mechanisms of discrimination of foreigners on the work market and in the educational system. The Polish part of this study is co-ordinated by the Institute of Public Affairs and conducted by a research team headed by Joanna Kurczewska. The present analysis is based on the results of a qualitative study of two specially selected schools conducted in 2004, i.e., after Poland's accession to the European Union.

¹ Masoud Kalami, John Burns, Ruth Wodak and Gerard Delanty were responsible for the different stages of the project. This project was mainly designed for the countries of the "old" European Union and the research teams from new member states (Poland and Cyprus) are analysing inchoate forms of phenomena which are present on a mass scale in Western Europe. For more detailed information on this project see http://www.multietn.uu.se/index_eng.htm.

Author's address: Graduate School for Social Research, Institute of Philosophy & Sociology Polish Academy of Sciences; e-mail: mikolajpawlak@wp.pl

The investigation of the educational system, i.e., the system of social institutions created around the school system, were part of a broader stage of the larger study. The objective of this stage of the project was to prepare a series of case studies which would help to analyse the specific mechanisms of institutional discrimination of immigrants. The original school studies were designed for countries with large scale immigration where, as e.g., in France, one often finds schools where the significant number of pupils are children of immigrants. Each national team was asked to select two schools and conduct in-depth interviews with teachers and relevant representatives of civil society at each school. Interviews were conducted according to the same blueprint in all eight countries participating in the project. On the basis of these interviews school portraits showing the institutional mechanisms which may lead to discrimination were compiled.

It is important to remember that this project was masterminded for countries in which immigration is a significant and universal phenomenon around which many institutions have developed. Poland is a country in which immigration only began a few years ago. We may say that Poland is in the protoinstitutional stage of coping with immigration. Many institutions are sprouting spontaneously in those areas of social life where immigrants are present whereas state immigration policy is only beginning to be created. In the effort to cope with this newly diagnosed problem, institutions and individuals often refer to the experience of Western countries which have a longer tradition of hosting immigrants. This adaptation of Western solutions to Polish reality is not always successful. Protoinstitutionality means lack of structures, spontaneous actions undertaken by individual actors who try to implement norms based on wishful thinking and solve problems as they emerge in idiosyncratic ways which are only beginning to be more standardised. Many areas of protoinstitutional activity are not legally regulated or do not have customarily developed procedures and therefore individuals must show initiative themselves and try to solve problems and resolve conflicts on their own.

The Lower Secondary School Study: Rationale

Poland is an emigrant rather than an immigrant country. There are no large foreign communities in Poland and therefore the schools selected for this study are exceptional by the very fact that they have foreigners on their roll call.

In accordance with the rationale of the project, the study was run in two schools belonging to the compulsory stage of education but also ones in which decisions concerning future educational tracks are made. In Poland lower secondary school

² In addition to the study of the educational system, Workpackage 4 included studies of the functioning of immigrants on the labour market. Interviews describing several different types of enterprises which employ foreigners and institutions dealing with labour exchange were collected. In addition to the case studies whose purpose was to present specific examples of solutions and institutional mechanisms, the general picture of immigrants in the educational system and on the labour market was to be reproduced on the basis of in-depth interviews with respective experts (central and provincial administration officers responsible for the labour market, school inspectors, social activists etc.).

meets these criteria. Children attend this type of school from age 13 to age 16. In order to elucidate the studied problem on the basis of very limited material, two schools with a very distinct approach to the problem of immigrant pupils, representing two extremes, were chosen. One school is situated in a small city, seat of the administrative district, which has had a hostel for people applying for the status of refugee or political asylum in its catchment area for the last five years. The second lower secondary school is an elite civic school in Warsaw, attended by children of well-off Poles or rich foreigners. This school also accepts children of refugees or other immigrants.

The two schools differ under many aspects so the case comparison presented below must take these major differences into consideration, particularly in the following dimensions: school facilities, student background, educational ideology, teachers' attitude, etc.

In each school six in-depth interviews were conducted with members of the teaching staff. Representatives of various civic organisations involved with the school (e.g., the Parents' Council or School Friends Society) were also interviewed. ³ The interview scenario contained blocks of questions on: the respondent's role in the school; his/her general evaluation of the attitude of the school as an institution towards immigrant pupils; the situation of immigrant pupils (e.g., vernacular language proficiency); the role of these factors in the procedure of marking and promoting immigrant children; comparison of the schools attended by immigrant children with other schools; description of the educational tracks to which immigrant children are directed and the institutional mechanisms involved; the role of gatekeepers (people who decide who can be allowed to pursue a track leading to certain positions or institutions) and the rules to which these gatekeepers adhere when making their decisions; conflict and conflict resolution. The interviewees were also briefly interviewed about the presence of "others" in textbooks and the situation of teachers of immigrant background in the studied institutions. The material collected during the interviews enabled the elaboration of portraits of the two schools and particularly of the institutional mechanisms which these schools have developed with respect to immigrant pupils.

Two Strategies: Admittance and Encouragement

The two studied schools have developed two different strategies of conduct with respect to immigrant pupils. Both strategies are based on openness but their realisation leads to different consequences. The consequence of the admittance strategy, of which there is little awareness, is exclusion and marginalisation of immigrant children.

The admittance strategy is based on passive openness towards immigrant pupils who have equal rights with their Polish peers with respect to all aspects of school life. Teachers often even do them a favour by excusing them from certain duties which would be too difficult, e.g., because of poor language skills. This strategy takes its name from the fact that immigrant pupils are admitted to everything the school has

³ The interview scenario was constructed in such a way as to enable comparisons between the participant countries.

to offer. All they have to do is take advantage of this opportunity. Not only must they want to do so, they must also know that they are allowed to participate and know how to do so. No help is offered, however, and therefore openness is spurious. Unaided, children from other cultural backgrounds, unfamiliar with Polish reality, are unable to take advantage of what is offered. They need help.

They get this help when the encouragement strategy is adopted. This strategy involves actively opening up to others. Not only are the opportunities offered to Polish pupils open to immigrant pupils but the immigrant students are actually encouraged to partake of these opportunities which are pointed out to them and often specially "put in their way." The important difference between the two strategies, the first of which is adopted in the public lower secondary school in the small city and the second in the civic lower secondary school in the capital, is that the encouragement strategy is deliberately planned. It was consciously developed as opposed to the admittance strategy which developed without any plan in the course of day-to-day contacts with immigrant children and was the outcome of ad-hoc coping with current problems. The encouragement strategy is constructed and well thought out whereas the admittance strategy is the effect of the institutionalisation of practices which were responses to minor problems.

Portrait of an "Ordinary" School in a Small City

The public lower secondary school in the small city is attended by 550 pupils grouped in 20 classes with at least 27 pupils per class. Forty-five teachers work at this school. The school is attended by pupils who live in the town itself, its suburbs and surrounding villages. As far as the number of pupils and conditions are concerned, this is a typical small city public school. A worker's dormitory, hired as a hostel for its clients by the Bureau for the Organisation of Centres for Refugee Applicants and Asylum Seekers at the Office of Repatriation and Aliens, is located within the school's catchment area.

The hostel is currently inhabited largely by Chechens, the vast majority among foreigners seeking refugee status in Poland. The Chechens are applying for this status in Poland on the grounds that they are persecuted in the Russian Federation and that they come from territories which are in a state of war. In accordance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child ratified by the Republic of Poland, every boy and girl, whatever his or her status (including those who are in Poland illegally or still in the process of granting refugee status) has a right to free primary education which, in Poland, means primary school and lower secondary school, the two obligatory levels of education. Hence children of refugees and asylum seekers who live in the aforementioned hostel attend the school in their catchment area. All in all, about ten Chechen children attended the nearby lower secondary school in the 2003/2004 school year. We must point out that in Poland one does not usually find foreign communities in towns of this size (except in towns lying within the agglomerations of large cities). Towns in which refugee hostels are located are the only exception.

The school situation of Chechen children whose parents are applying for refugee status is determined by four major factors: the inability to speak Polish; the transitional nature of their term of residence in the town in which they attend school; their treatment of Poland as a transit country. The short term of residence is determined by the procedure of application for refugee status and the practices of functioning of refugee hostels. The said procedure should last six months. It is actually longer but applicants often change hostels or, due to another factor we will discuss presently, they try to get to one of the Western European countries on their own. These attempts are very frequent because Poland is treated as a transit country. Refugees intend to settle in the richer countries of the Old EU.

The teachers of the studied school pointed out that the lower secondary school syllabus is too difficult to understand without speaking Polish proficiently. Pupils who do not have command of the Polish language have difficulty understanding the terminology and in addition to this, lack of any familiarity whatsoever with the cultural context is an insurmountable barrier in the case of so-called humanistic subjects.

For the reasons mentioned above, both the teachers and the hostel staff treat the school attendance of the young Chechens mainly as a way to learn Polish by "diving in at the deep end" and a way of breaking the monotony of hostel life. Since the children do not stay very long in the location of the study, teachers feel that it is difficult to view them as sterling participants of the educational process: "if I only knew that these children would be coming to school for three years, everything would have hands and feet. It would be worth getting involved, organising lessons, encounters to get to know their national specifics and acquaint them with ours. That would make sense."

The respondents told us that the refugee children were sometimes promoted to the next class in primary school but they never managed to be promoted in lower secondary school. Most of them have free student status. They do not have to take tests and, the headmaster explained, most of them are not marked. The teachers are convinced that this would often make no sense because of the children's poor command of the Polish language. The teachers prefer to avoid the bureaucratic problems caused by uncertainty as to how long these pupils will stay in their class and put the children's names in the register in pencil. I believe that this is a very good symbolic illustration of the insecure status of the refugee children in this school. Another noteworthy way of avoiding problems is the practice of placing these children two per class so that "the child does not get lost in class," explained the headmaster. This way, the young Chechens take care of themselves but this practice also dramatically slows down their progress in learning Polish and their integration with the rest of the class.

We must point out that Chechen pupils often do not pay much attention to their studies either. There are several reasons for this. The most important reason is that many pupils and their parents know that Poland is not their target country and therefore they do not feel any need to learn Polish and obtain a recognised Polish education. "The most reasonable excuse is to say that they will soon be leaving and there is no need to waste time on these people because all this putting in the register, writing down, are just more problems for us."

The next important factor is the school's lack of methodical and financial skills to teach so specific group of pupils and lack of preparedness of the entire social community in the city to accept a group so culturally different as the Chechens. Refugee hostels are situated in small towns for financial and organisational reasons.

All the respondents stressed that "others" evoke resentment in the studied town. Most respondents mentioned lack of tolerance in their family town. In their opinion, unemployment and general poverty only deepen the inhabitants' negative attitude towards the hostel inhabitants who, as the local legend goes, receive a lot of pocket money. The local population feels frustrated when it sees that in their neighbourhood there is a group of people supported by the government when they themselves have to accept a very poor standard of living.

One symptomatic example of lack of organisational skills is the ignorance, both at school and in the hostel, of the fact that according to the law the school can organise extra Polish lessons for foreigners and that the agent who runs the school, i.e., the city, is obliged to pay for these lessons. In a way the city, like the Chechen children which are "thrown into deep water" so that they learn to speak Polish, has been "thrown into deep water" so that it learns how to relate to the foreigners. The pivotal point in these relations is the school, an institution prepared to teach typical Polish pupils, which all of a sudden and in a rather accidental way, without any help from without, must cope with a very untypical group of pupils. Hence the school's coping strategy is developed without any plan, spontaneously, in the course of dealing with current problems.

The lack of mutual understanding between two groups which are forced to live side by side was very powerfully manifested during a violent conflict which burst out in the small city two years prior to our study. This event organised the relations between the two groups and all interviewees mentioned it. A seemingly minor quarrel between a Polish boy and a Chechen one during a physical training class triggered a series of minor revenges which exacerbated to the extent that, to defend their dignity, the inhabitants of the hostel decided to "take the matter into their hands" and, as a member of the hostel staff told us, "to administer justice in their own way." Over a dozen boys and men stormed into the school, beat up a number of pupils haphazardly and destroyed some facilities. The police had to intervene and the local community demanded that the Office of Repatriation and Aliens close the hostel. Mediations helped to alleviate the conflict but distrust continued and at the time of the study the local Poles were still very wary of the inhabitants of the hostel. When telling us about later attempts to reconcile the two groups, the school councillor explained that they resembled group therapy where "everybody vented their mutual resentments." The diagnosed source of the conflict was mutual ignorance of the rules regulating the lives of the two communities. Polish teachers and carers were not initially aware that the Chechens treated petty conflicts which they themselves dismissed as "ordinary raw lads' pranks" very seriously. The Chechens, on the other hand, were simply not aware that conflicts should be resolved by, e.g., lodging a complaint. They did not accept this method because it was inconsistent with their code of conduct which forbade seeking the help of any alien power when solving one's own problems. After a brief intensification of mutual contact and attempts to reconcile the Chechen and Polish communities animated by the Office of Repatriation and Aliens staff, mutual relations stabilised at the minimum acceptable level. Today, according to our respondents, the hostel inhabitants are treated with great distrust and are simply avoided.

To summarise this account of the "ordinary" school we must stress that its strategy is to minimise problems. The teachers do everything they can to have as little trouble as possible with the Chechen pupils. The mechanisms of treatment of immigrant pupils are focused on avoiding any problems which these pupils might cause. We called this strategy the admittance strategy. Chechen children may avail themselves of everything the school has to offer but the teachers, in an effort to minimise their burden, do little to encourage them. These teachers do not waste their energy on constructing a holistic and masterminded strategy of dealing with pupils from the refugee hostel because they do not want to attract more responsibilities and problems than they have already.

An Elite School in Warsaw

The second school in which our study was run is a civic lower secondary school situated in Warsaw city centre. Children from all over town attend this school. Selection takes place according to two different mechanisms, a difficult entrance examination where there are always more candidates than places and a school fee (790 PLN at the time of the research). Thanks to this fee the school can afford to employ very good teachers and pay for facilities rarely found in public lower secondary school. The pupils, meanwhile, come from well situated families and backgrounds which value education highly. The school is relatively small with 250 pupils in 12 classes with no more than 22 pupils per class.

In addition to the children who pass examinations the Warsaw school also accepts children who are not well off. Two places in each class are reserved for pupils who are exempted from paying fees and do not have to pass the entrance examination. These are children of poor families who live near the school, children who live in orphanages and also children of refugees. Charity is not the only motive. This is a deliberate practice thanks to which—say the staff—pupils from elite backgrounds learn to be tolerant and more sensitive. The parents of the Polish pupils who pass the examination to this school are well aware of the model of education which the school practices and since they chose the school themselves, this means that they accept this model. In addition to this group, there are over 10 Vietnamese children who passed the entrance examination. The cases of immigrant children described by the respondents suggest that some of these children made a special effort to get into this school because they did not feel well in other schools where they were discriminated against. The young Vietnamese who got into the school through the examination net typically said during the qualifying interview that they wanted to study at this school because they heard that it does not persecute Vietnamese people. In other words, children of refugees or immigrants choose this environment because they know it is

receptive to "others." This applies to both the teachers who develop the program and the parents and pupils who accept it.

The school has a developed system of helping pupils who may have problems at school for various reasons. This system is also addressed to the children of refugees who nearly always need help. One of the teachers is made responsible for children who require extra assistance. The children of refugees often turn to this teacher for support. She unburdens the class teachers by co-ordinating the extra tutorials and monitoring her charges' domestic problems. Pupils attending the upper secondary school which is associated with the lower secondary school within one organisational unit are part of the system. They coach their younger colleagues as part of their volunteer work. Great effort is also made to stimulate the social functioning of the young refugees. There is a special budget for outings (for example to the cinema) and these pupils do not have to pay. These are all elements of a deliberately realised encouragement strategy.

Another very important and successful way of integrating immigrant children is to make them experts in various class projects. Each class takes part in preparations to present the culture of the country of origin of their foreign peer. These preparations last all year. On the one hand, Polish pupils benefit by broadening their knowledge and on the other hand the social status of the pupils whose culture is valorised is strengthened and the pupil is, so to say, forced into the limelight:

"this way, they not only gain full rights, they also become attractive because they are a sort of scientific aid for our children because thanks to them they can learn about countries other than their own so this is masterminded not only to help these children but also to enable them to teach their peers something about the world, their culture, their country, and that works"

Refugee children are encouraged in many ways to participate in the social life of the school and thanks to this encouragement various doubts concerning culturally alien forms of spending their leisure time are dissipated. One example is a Chechen girl who had never gone to gym class before. Sports had been a forbidden activity for girls in her Muslim community.

Refugee children who attend the Warsaw school manage to be promoted with difficulty. The school also helps them to get into the upper secondary school which is institutionally connected with the lower secondary school. The headmistress is very committed to helping children in trouble and she often monitors their further development and intervenes when, for example, they want to go to university. This would not be possible were it not for her enthusiasm and her commitment to the idea and for her renowned position in the Warsaw educational community.⁴

The following conclusion, mainly supported by the experience of the Warsaw school, comes to mind. No systemic methods of integration and assistance for the children of refugees have been developed. Any success in this area is the result of the hard work of isolated enthusiasts who are fascinated with what they are doing and

⁴ One very poignant example of the headmistress's determination to help children who are in a difficult situation is the fact that she adopted a young Armenian orphan who was not granted refugee status and was ejected from the hostel for persons applying for refugee status.

determined to succeed rather than the effect of procedures which have been masterminded and implemented throughout the country. The practices of these enthusiasts are usually closely linked to their local community and would be hard to generalise. This conclusion corroborates the observation that Poland is at the protoinstitutional stage of coping with immigration. As far as the elite Warsaw lower secondary school is concerned, its successes in the teaching of young immigrants are rooted in the charisma of its headmistress who has managed to transmit her ideas and educational ideology to the rest of her teaching staff.

Conclusions

The following differences between the two schools can be distinguished. The Warsaw school chooses its pupils itself and the parents of pupils who have been admitted on the basis of the entrance examination accept the syllabus and the fact that some pupils will be culturally alien. The two schools differ considerably with respect to the educational aspirations of its pupils and the financial resources they spend on education and on the pupils themselves. Another significant factor is the fact that Warsaw is becoming a multi-cultural city. In most small towns in Poland encounters with ethnic others can easily lead to culture shock. In Warsaw, one meets foreigners every day although the number of foreigners or immigrants in the Polish capital is much, much smaller than in western European metropolises.

Warsaw has an educational market. Parents have a choice of schools. They can choose from a wide assortment of private and civic schools which have a variety of educational goals and an equally wide assortment of competing public schools which are trying their best to attract the best pupils. The civic lower secondary school which we studied is very specific about its model of education and it attracts pupils who accept this model. This way, pupils are positively disposed to encounters with "others" from the very start and these encounters are one of the elements of its syllabus. In the small city, with its high level of unemployment and very sparse intelligentsia whose ethos includes openness to "others," there is no educational market comparable to the one in the capital. Here, inchoate competitiveness takes place between three public lower secondary schools but the majority of pupils chose the schools to which they are assigned according to their catchment area anyway.

Another major difference between the two schools is that they adopt different strategies in their dealings with immigrant pupils. These strategies, called admittance and encouragement, were outlined above. The admittance strategy does not explicitly apply mechanisms of exclusion. Immigrant children are allowed to participate in all aspects of school life. However, they do not take advantage of this opportunity because they often do not know that they can and also because the opportunities to which they have access are unfamiliar and confusing. The Chechen children from the refugee hostel who attend the school in the small city often probably do not know that nobody has forbidden them to come to school discos—they do not know what a disco is and anyway, school life goes on beside them. This is one of the

symptoms of the fiction of free education in Poland.⁵ According to the teachers, everything is all right and immigrant children do not participate because they do not want to. In my opinion this problem is rooted in lack of experience with other cultures. It is unthinkable for people who live in a homogeneous community that one may not understand behaviours which are ubiquitous in that community or be afraid to participate. In the Warsaw school, meanwhile, refugee children are deliberately encouraged to participate and helped to overcome the barriers caused by their being "different." This school has adopted an encouragement strategy. Immigrant children are explicitly instructed about the meaning of various activities and encouraged to take part in them in order to overcome their cultural barriers.

The Warsaw school is also exceptional in that the teachers are very committed and that their level of involvement surpasses their professional duties by far. The teachers, and especially the headmistress, are passionate about what they do. The procedures and ideas they have developed to work with foreign children are not motivated by sense of duty, they are motivated by fascination and the need to meet the challenge. These procedures and ideas are adjusted to the environment however—an environment which is equally enthusiastic regarding learning and tolerance. We may only guess that if they tried to graft their methods to the small town environment they would not be so successful.

Refugee children have often experienced great hardship which has forced them to flee from their country. In Poland they have to cope with new problems (much less dramatic, of course). If they land in an ordinary school, a vicious circle develops. Teachers soon realise that it is not worth investing too much effort in these children because they will want to leave Poland anyway and travel further west. They develop a number of mechanisms and practices which will reduce the cost of their work (such as entering names in the register in pencil, putting two refugee children in a class etc.). As a result, sporadic pupils who would be willing to live in Poland are already submitted to numerous practices which discourage and exclude them at school, the basic agency of socialisation to civic life.

The fact that one of the studied schools has succeeded does not mean that the general situation of refugee pupils will improve either. In my opinion, the solutions and procedures applied at this school cannot be transplanted to different soil. They are too dependent on the involvement of the teachers, fired by ideological motives which are the exception rather than the rule in the teaching community. The positively disposed background of the Polish pupils at this school (i.e., the intelligentsia) is also a significant factor.

Paradoxically, the educational success of the Warsaw lower secondary school may have a negative effect on the inchoate system of education for foreigners. According to Marta Zahorska (2002), a sociologist who has been investigating the Polish edu-

⁵ In order to participate in school life on par with one's peers, the child must bear certain financial costs (we are not talking about books, copybooks, pens and pencils etc. here). These are the costs of socialising sanctioned by the school. For example, if a disco is held on school premises, the children must pay. This means that poorer children are left out and untypical children such as the children of refugees are certainly excluded.

cational system for many years, civic schools have created a niche of their own on the Polish educational market but they have not revolutionised the market as such. According to the theory which Zahorska has borrowed from the work of the American economist Albert O. Hirschman (1970), they provide an exit for those participants of the public educational system who have been unable to cope with it for one reason or another. Very often these are individuals who demand more of the system but are unable to modify the organisation in which they have been functioning by means of their own voice. This is having a negative effect on the system in general because the children of more active parents, more willing to improve the system, i.e., children who are often more successful at school and have higher social status, are leaving the public schools (Zahorska 2002: 171). If we apply Hirschman's theory to the analysis of refugee pupils, we may come to similar conclusions. Isolated educational organisations resembling the Warsaw lower secondary school which we studied will attract refugees who intend to settle in Poland, are more educated and are valuable assets from the point of view of the state's immigration policy. In Poland today one can hardly say that the immigrants themselves can improve the organisations to which they belong, e.g., school, by means of voice. But by the very fact that the more efficacious immigrants are managing to exit the schools which will not foster their success and get into schools which will help them to succeed, the whole mechanism and the need to change typical schools is being weakened, meaning that the typical schools will continue to discourage and marginalise future refugee pupils. The civic school which succeeds in educating a multi-cultural group of pupils will act as a safety valve for the small group of refugees who want to settle in Poland anyway. However, all refugee children first land in schools which, like the first school described in this report, have developed defence mechanisms against the problems which untypical pupils such as refugees might create in the smooth functioning of the establishment (these may simply be trivial bureaucratic hassles). If this happens, a group of institutions producing a poorly educated, poorly integrated, marginalised and ethnically distinctive group will consolidate.

References

Hirschman, A.O. 1970. Exit, Voice, and Loyalty: Responses to Decline in Firms, Organizations, and States. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Z a h o r s k a, M. 2002. Szkoła: między państwem, społeczeństwem a rynkiem [School: between state, society and market]. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Akademickie "Żak."